



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/696,518	10/29/2003	Suk Woo Nam	0001381USU/2242	6378
7590	09/07/2004		EXAMINER	
Charles N. J. Ruggiero, Esq. Ohlandt, Greeley, Ruggiero & Perle, L.L.P. 10th Floor One Landmark Square Stamford, CT 06901-2682			MAI, NGOCLAN THI	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1742	

DATE MAILED: 09/07/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
	10/696,518	NAM ET AL.	
	Examiner	Art Unit	
	Ngoclan T. Mai	1742	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --
Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on _____.
- 2a) This action is FINAL. 2b) This action is non-final.
- 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) Claim(s) 1-4 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) Claim(s) 1 and 2 is/are allowed.
- 6) Claim(s) 3 and 4 is/are rejected.
- 7) Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.
 Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
 Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
 - a) All b) Some * c) None of:
 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____
3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08) Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____.	5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
	6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____.

DETAILED ACTION

1. Claims 1-2 are allowed.

Allowable Subject Matter

2. The following is a statement of reasons for the indication of allowable subject matter:

US patent 3,535,103 discloses method of making Ni-Al alloy comprising heating nickel particles in the presence of aluminum particles and AlCl₃ to a temperature high enough, to form AlCl and then cooling the powder mass to a temperature at which AlCl disproportionates into Al metal and AlCl₃; the Al metal then deposits on the nickel particles and alloys with the nickel. The heating and cooling steps for making Ni-Al alloy disclosed are performed between 1000 to 1010°C and 980 to 990°C, respectively. To prevent the powder from sintered the patent teaches employing inert powder such as alumina.

The main difference between the claimed method and that of the patent is that the heating and the cooling in the patent are performed at temperatures higher than fusion point Al metal, which has a melting temperature of 660°C.

For this reason the examiner finds the claim is patentable and non-obvious over the teaching of the patent and any of the cited prior art.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

3. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

4. Claims 3-4 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Whitfield.

Whitfield discloses method of making Ni-Al alloy comprising heating nickel particles in the presence of aluminum particles and AlCl₃ to a temperature high enough, to form AlCl and then cooling the powder mass to a temperature at which AlCl disproportionates into Al metal and AlCl₃; the Al metal then deposits on the nickel particles and alloys with the nickel. The heating and cooling steps for making Ni-Al alloy disclosed are performed between 1000 to 1010°C and 980 to 990°C, respectively. To prevent the powder from sintered the patent teaches employing inert powder such as alumina.

Although Ni-Al alloy powder taught by Whitfield is formed from method difference than the method of making the claimed Ni-Al alloy, the examiner finds no distinction between the claimed Ni-Al alloy powder and that of Whitfield, thus the claimed Ni-Al alloy powder anticipates the alloy powder taught by Whitfield.

An old or obvious product produced by a new method is not patentable as a product, whether claimed in a product by process claims or not. Note that applicant has the burden of proof in such case. Furthermore, it has been established that a product by process claim is directed to the product per se, no matter how actually made, *In re Kira*, 190 USPQ 15 at 17 (footnote 3). See also *In re Thorpe*, 227 USPQ 964 (CAFC 1985), which makes it clear that it is the patentability of the final product per se which must be determined in a product by process claim and not the patentability of the process.

5. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Ngoclan T. Mai whose telephone number is (571) 272-1246. The examiner can normally be reached on 7:30-4:00 PM Monday-Friday.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Roy King can be reached on (571) 272-1244. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).


Ngoclan T. Mai
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 1742

n.m.